

To: Edmond Theobald, Manlius Town Board Supervisor
301 Brooklea Drive
Fayetteville, NY 13066

From: Bruno Puetzer
8037 Changing Seasons Circle
Fayetteville, NY 13066

BP



I was unaware Kinsella Quarry was applying for a permit to expand operations until I was asked by Barbara Rivette (a colleague on a former committee which met with Thomas Kinsella to discuss operations at the present location) to read the proposal and comment on it.

I freely admit that I am no expert on quarrying operations; the little I do know I learned from Mr. Kinsella during those former meetings. So I wondered what I could contribute to an appraisal of the East Fayetteville Quarry by examining the documents.

And while I lack mining expertise, I have had extensive involvement with documentation, as a student producing papers, a thesis, and a dissertation, as a writing teacher for more than 50 years, and as an employee contributing to or observing the creation of various position papers. The Cardinal Rule for using references is that the references should be up-to-date; the Cardinal Sin of using references is that by selectively choosing and disregarding documents, a writer or petitioner can substantiate any pre-determined conclusion. Of equal importance is the common misunderstanding that length and documentation mean accuracy. Too many technical writers use excess pages to obfuscate and camouflage. Length alone should not impress.

What should disturb those in charge of acting upon this application is that the 20 Kinsella "References" (52-53) in the *Expanded Environmental Assessment East Fayetteville Quarry* are seemingly outdated sources. Of those 20 references, only four are from the twenty-first century and the latest one of those four is a map and chart, not an up-to-date source of technical information on the effects of quarrying.

Disturbing are the dates for reference to blasting effects on water (1980, 1982, 1987, 1982, 1996), the dates for codes and regulations (1985, ND, 1992), the date for transportation or trip generation (2003), the date for assessing and mitigating noise (2001), the date for air quality (2000), the dates for the environmental effects of blasting (1971, 1994, a blasting manual from 1987, 1980), the date for social/legal consequences of quarrying (1981), and the date for soil conservation (1977). Surely more up-to-date information exists.

Several conclusions can be drawn from these dates: first, the whole report was a rewrite of a previous request without any attempt to update the information. Boilerplate form-filling is OK, but most of these data were taken from sources **25 to 40 years old**. Another conclusion, more disturbing, is that the assessment drew upon sources that would offer only a favorable showing of the data, also known as cherry picking the data. I certainly hope that is not true.

I pass this information and my thoughts on to you with the hope that you will share this letter and its information with the Town Board for its consideration.

cc: Joseph Lupia, Chairman Manlius Town Planning Board
Barbara Rivette